

Word and Sentence: Two Perspectives Bhartrihari and Wittgenstein

A three-day seminar was held from 12 to 14 December 1994 at Sahitya Akademi, New Delhi, on 'Word and Sentence: Two Perspectives: Bhartrihari and Wittgenstein', in memory of late Prof. K.J. Shah. Prof. K.J. Shah had worked very hard for this seminar, and what was to have been an event in which he wanted to play an active role turned out to be an event organised in his memory. It was jointly sponsored by Indian Institute of Advanced Study, Shimla, and Sahitya Akademi, New Delhi. In his inaugural remarks Prof. U.R. Anantha Murthy, President, Sahitya Akademi, drew attention to the significance of the seminar and paid rich tributes to Prof. K.J. Shah's contribution to our intellectual life. In his key-note address, Prof. Vidya Nivas Mishra, gave a brief introduction to the life and thought of Bhartrihari, and drew attention to the common linguistic concern of Bhartrihari and Wittgenstein, otherwise separated by time, place and tradition. He also drew attention to the precarious position of language in the modern world, dominated by technological rationality. While this address focused on Bhartrihari, the other key-note address by Prof. D.P. Chattopadhyay gave a brief and lucid introduction to the central linguistic themes in Wittgenstein.

In the first session in the afternoon, Kapil Kapur, discussed the concept of meaning in Bhartrihari in terms of the notion of Sabdartha, Padartha and Bodhartha. In his presentation, Kamallesh Datta Tripathi analysed the wider framework of Indian tradition, and then explicated the role of intuition and reason in Bhartrihari's philosophy of language in relation to that framework. The discussants included Kunjunniraja, R.P. Pandey and Lachman Khubchandani. The second session on the 13th morning opened with a paper by R.C. Pradhan on 'On Meaning Holism in Wittgenstein and Bhartrihari: A Study in Two Semantic Perspectives'. Focussing on the issue of meaning holism, he presented a complex comparative picture. He showed the points of agreement and difference between the two, but emphasised that they were united in their battle against empiricism, naturalism and conventionalism in understanding language and meaning. In his oral presentation, Arindam Chakravarti took a critical look at the very enterprise of

comparing the two. In the third, afternoon session, Sibajiban Bhattacharya, while focussing on Bhartrihari and Wittgenstein, also invoked Jagadisa's theory which rejected the assumption that a word-meaning already contains a relation in a general sense. He related the notion of meaning to the sentence as an inter-related sequence of words. Hiranmoy Banerjee made a presentation in this session. In the fourth session on the 14th morning, Lachman Khubchandani presented a paper on the concept of speech in a comparative analysis of Bhartrihari and Wittgenstein. After a very detailed examination, he concluded that the relative roles of intuition and reason in speech are relevant to the communicative task of discourse. He ended by quoting Shah, 'Intuition without reason lacks power and reason without intuition lacks direction'. In the second presentation, Ashok R. Kelkar offered an overall perspective of Bhartrihari on language. Then he made a brief comparison between him and Wittgenstein. In Bhartrihari's view, language was more than a means of communication. It was Jnana embodying the cosmic principle, *sabda-tattva*. Hence, he emphasised *vacya* (message) more than *vacaka* (speech vehicle). Kelkar also suggested that Bhartrihari regarded universals rather than particulars 'as the basis of the unity of word meaning'. In the fifth and final session in the afternoon, P.K. Mukhopadhyaya presented a paper on 'On Alternative Conceptions of Sentence and Conflicting Perspectives of Language'. He began by explicating the implications of the thesis that sentence enjoys primacy over words. According to him Bhartrihari had two different conceptions of sentence, sentence as *pratipadaka* (revealing) and sentence as *prati-padya* (revealed). His paper was devoted to a detailed exposition of the two issues. The last presentation of the day and the seminar was Probal Dasgupta's stimulating and aphoristic paper, 'The Sentence as Freedom'. In a very fascinating account, he suggested that freedom as vision (*dristi*) meant an undistorted flow of content from texts and between texts. But one could also interrupt this flow of freedom by contingent considerations, by history. But in both cases, freedom is sustained provided the flow is not hypostatized.

Pahari Language and Literature

On May 2-3, 1995, a two-day National Seminar on Pahari Language and Literature was organised at the Indian Institute of Advanced Study, Shimla under the joint auspices of the Institute, Himachal Academy of Arts, Culture and Languages, Central Institute of Indian Languages, Mysore, Himachal Pahari Sahitya Sabha, Delhi and Dr. Y.S. Parmar Pahari Shodh Sansthan, Hamirpur (H.P.).

Shri Sudhakar Rao Naik, Governor, Himachal Pradesh inaugurated the seminar. Professor N.C. Parashar, Education Minister, Himachal Pradesh, presided over the function. The Governor welcomed the idea of development of regional languages and their use as medium of instruction at school and college level. He hoped that Pahari would be able to find its place in the developed languages of the country.

In his welcome address Professor Mrinal Miri, Director of the Institute, highlighted the activities and programmes of the Indian Institute of Advanced Study and emphasized the need for collaborative programmes in various intellectual fields. Sudarshan Vashistha, Secretary, Himachal Academy of Arts, Culture and Languages, Shimla, highlighted the schemes and programmes of the Academy. An exhibition of books written in Pahari and Miniature Paintings was also inaugurated by the Governor.

Professor N.C. Parashar, summed up the steps being taken by the state government to encourage writing and translation in the language. He said that this was the second seminar of its kind, the first one having been held in 1989 in New Delhi.

In the first session two papers on 'Sources and References of History of Pahari Language' and 'Pahari Chitrakala with relation to Pahari Language' were presented by Bansi Ram Sharma and V.C. Ohri respectively. It was felt that the Linguistic Survey conducted by G.A. Grierson years ago, had its limitations and a fresh survey of Indian languages was called for.

In the second session papers were presented by Piyush Guleri, Hari Ram Justa and C.R.B. Lalit. Dr. Guleri's paper was on 'Pracheen Pahari Gadya Sahitya'. H.R. Justa's paper entitled 'Pahari Language: the mother tongue of Hill People' surveyed the position

and status of various dialects in the erstwhile princely states.

The third paper presented by Shri C.R.B. Lalit related to the subject of 'Folk Theatrical Tradition in Himachal Pradesh'. In the discussion that followed, it was emphasised that textual references and cultural terminology should have been more carefully explained.

On this occasion a Pahari poetic symposium was arranged in the Library Hall and a brief cultural programme was also presented. About 15 poets took part in the poetic symposium.

On the second day of the Seminar, Des Raj Dogra presented a paper on 'Pahari mein Anuvaad Sahitya'. In the discussion it was pointed out that reference bibliography from all sub-languages of Pahari should be incorporated in the paper to project the comparative vocabulary of the language. In this session Shami Sharma's Paper 'Pahari mein Vyanga Rachna', Piyooosh Guleri's paper 'Pahari kavita ki Vikas Yatra', and Ashwini Garg's 'Pahari mein Natak/Ekanki Rachna' were also presented and discussed. This session was presided over by Dr. J.C. Sharma.

The last session of the seminar was devoted to Linguistic Studies of Pahari Language, with presentations by J.C. Sharma (Diminutives in Western Pahari of H.P.), M. R. Thakur (Pahari, Sanskrit Aur Pali ka Tulnatmak Adhyayn), A.R. Chauhan (Word derivation in Kangri), Shyam Lal Dogra (Comparison of Dogri and Pahari), Madhubala, H.K. Patial (Archaic Words to some Western Pahari Dialects: A Historical Perspective). D.P. Patnaik stressed the point that Pahari, known as Western Pahari according to G.A. Grierson, has a unique vocabulary and linguistic system and will emerge as a powerful language with rich literature in the near future.

Eminent Hindi writer Shri Bhisim Sahni said that with the present seminar on Pahari Language and Literature it has amply been proved that Pahari has made its place among Indian languages and that it has a rich historical and cultural background. He suggested that notable works written in Pahari be got translated into other languages of the world. He was of the view that Pahari literature should reach more and more readers through the print media.

COLLOQUIUM ON PANINI

A colloquium on Panini was held at the Institute from 22 to 24 May 1995. As its convenor, Prof. D.D. Mahulkar, explained, Panini and his seminal contribution to the theory and practice of language, provide us with rich theoretical resources to tackle many crucial contemporary problems, not only in the field of grammar and linguistics but even beyond in several other domains such as social sciences where there is bound to be a growing need for the employment of formal symbolic systems. It is worth noting that the recent spurt of such formal languages and metalanguage systems has been very strongly fuelled by the computer technology. In fact, Panini's logico-mathematical methodology is now being increasingly recognised globally as a very useful means for illuminating and solving our epistemological aporias in several fields of knowledge.

Besides the convenor himself, several distinguished specialists in Paninian studies across the country participated. Additionally, the

resident Fellows of the Institute, with its Director Professor Mrinal Miri in the lead, also contributed to the lively discussions on the papers presented. The scholars who presented papers were: H.S. Ananthanarayana (Mysore), Soroja V. Bhate (Pune), Siniruddha Dash (Madras), S.D. Joshi (Pune), Satya Swarup Mishra (Varanasi) J.A.F. Roødbergen and Prem Singh (Delhi University). The tone of the discussion was inevitably highly technical, but the participants did not hesitate to venture out of their specialist niches to tackle general philosophical issues. In fact, while some papers were very narrowly technical, there were others which attempted to situate Panini within a historical context or a philosophical-cultural tradition. Even more significantly, Panini was harnessed as an invaluable theoretical resource in tackling central contemporary issues such as systems theory, algorithmics and the even more arcane areas of scientific philosophy. Panini emerged as fresh and as relevant as he must have been two thousand years ago!

A CORRECTION

Our report on the national Seminar on 'Modern India: Terms of Discourse', published on page 14 of February 1995 issue failed to mention, quite inadvertently, Prof. Javeed Alam's important paper 'Colonialism and the Possibility of the Authentic: A note on the Notion of the Alien in the Conceptual Language'. Prof. Alam provides trenchant critique of the thesis that 'the modern vocabulary of our politics and cultural life is and will remain ungrounded in Indian social reality,' and, instead, argues that vocabulary needs to be, and can be, so grounded, after a rigorous and critical scrutiny.

Editor

Pahari Language
contd. from page 18

Three resolutions, (i) inclusion of Pahari Language in the 8th Schedule of the Constitution, (ii) Recognition of Pahari Language by Sahitya Academy, New Delhi and (iii) Making

Pahari Language a medium of Instruction in the schools at an appropriate level in the state were unanimously adopted.

In the evening a colourful cultural programme was organised by the Departement of Languages and Culture, Shimla.

FORTHCOMING ACADEMIC EVENTS OF THE INSTITUTE

1. Symposium on 'Nonlinear Dynamics in Condensed Matter Physics' (14 and 15 August 1995). Convenor: Prof. S. Dattagupta, School of Physical Sciences, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi - 110067.
2. Study Week on 'Contemporary China' (4-9 September 1995). Convenor: Prof. K.R. Sharma, Department of Chinese and Japanese Studies, University of Delhi, Arts Faculty Extension, New Delhi-110007.
3. Seminar on 'Bio-Social Dimensions of Ageing' (13-15 November 1995). Convenor: Prof. J.S. Bajaj, Member, Planning Commission, Yojana Bhavan, Parliament Street, New Delhi-110001.
4. Seminar on 'The Life and Works of Saadat Hasan Manto' (4-7 October 1995). Convenor: Prof. Alok Bhalla, Central Institute of English and Foreign Languages, Hyderabad (A.P.).

RESTORATION OF RASHTRAPATI NIVAS: THE INTACH PERSPECTIVE

Phase II of the comprehensive programme for conservation of the historic building fabric of the Viceregal Lodge, its restoration and optimal adaptive reuse of the interior initially entails accurate documentation, exhaustive investigation and continuous monitoring of the present condition of the structure. The nature and extent of the decay patterns is being identified and analysed on accurate measured drawings. These detailed drawings, prepared after correction of discrepancies between earlier drawings and actual site conditions, will be scanned and digitised on computer-aided design system. This information, supplemented by detailed photographic documentation and a schedule of damaged areas will form the basis for all structural intervention and least invasive remedial and retrofit action by the structural, electrical and plumbing services consultants. It will also assist in the quantification and assessment of technical feasibility and cost of separate items of work. As specialist agencies will supplement the Central Public Works Department with the implementation of certain items of work requiring completion within a limited time frame of a high degree of craftsmanship or technical skill, this information base will enable prioritisation and subsequent monitoring, as well as preparation of a manual for future management and maintenance of every building component.

In addition to items such as consolidation of the soil and foundations, restoration and reconstruction of damaged areas of the superstruc-

ture and building components, renewal and augmentation of the service infrastructure, restoration of interiors and finishes, equally important concerns are the rational reallocation of space for the various refunctions of the Institute, reorganisation of the library taking into account plans for future expansion and computerisation, the design of the museum as a heritage interpretation facility for the large numbers of daily casual visitors, and the introduction of active uses into underutilised sections of the building.

Areas of concern identified uptil now, besides obvious maintenance related problems such as damaged downspouts, clogged drains and gutters, damaged roof flashings, earth piled up against the building, unsympathetic additions and alterations, continuous degradation of foundation and structural masonry from environmental effects, extensive water percolation due to rising damp and rainwater penetration through masonry joints, are weak zones of material failure, structural cracks and differential foundation settlement in large sections due to the ground morphology.

It is interesting to note that in 1888 itself, the Architect Henry Irwin had acknowledged that if he 'had been able to forecast the nature of such ground' - a thin reef supported on crushed shale, (or if he had investigated the site thoroughly), the building would have been placed 15' or so more to the south on more stable ground, and much of the subsequent structural damage to the building would not have occurred.

The Himalayan Flora Conservation Project at IAS

The Institute has undertaken an ambitious programme: 'The Himalayan Flora Conservation Project'. This is part of the larger expansion programme of the Rashtrapati Nivas's botanical gardens.

The project was formally inaugurated by Dr. R.S. Paroda, Director-General, Indian Council of Agricultural Research and Secretary, Department of Agricultural Research and Education, Government of India, New Delhi, on 28 June 1995.

The proposed project will be an attempt to conserve the rare and endangered plant species from the Himalayas. Moreover, such an effort will provide material to learners, nature lovers, visitors and will also add to the aesthetic value of this monumental heritage of our country. The Rashtrapati Nivas Botanical Gardens and its related projects will become a resource base of great significance to students, researchers and interested amateurs. The Botanical Gardens provide a fit setting not only for the conservation and preservation of rare flora, but will also help in preserving the rich fauna in and around its location. In view of the fast growing urbanization that has been eating into the forest cover of Shimla and the consequent depletion of our ecological heritage, the Rashtrapati Nivas Botanical Gardens will, in future, become not only a piece of precious environmental heritage, but will also be a step towards correcting the cruelty and imbalance that man's developmental activities do to nature.