

## review in depth

## Medieval craftsmanship in stone

R. N. Misra

## Sculpture Masterpieces from Orissa: Style and Iconography

by K. S. Behera and Thomas Donaldson

Aryan Books International, New Delhi, 1998; 165 pp+208 plates; Rs. 2200

The post-Gupta phase of Indian art, termed as 'medieval', has generally been represented as a phase of decline in the quality of sculpture, both in form and imagery. This perception partially flows from valorization of the antiquity factor, which constitutes the 'ancient' as qualitatively superior to the periods that followed. In that order, the early phase of Indian sculpture, roughly between the post-Mauryan times and the end of the Gupta period (c. 550 AD) is underscored as a period of innovation: when iconographies were creatively evolved, forms perfected, and classicism prevailed ubiquitously. These conclusions make sense eminently but problems arise when, in comparison, medieval Indian art is perceived as imitative, stereotyped, and bereft of purity of style or evocative imagery. Suffice it to say that such a circumscribed connoisseurship has often inhibited a proper appreciation of 'medieval' sculptures or the aesthetic ideals they evince in respect of their different form-language, compositional structure and integrated vision.

The book under review is, therefore, remarkable, for it concentrates primarily on medieval sculptures from the modern state of Orissa. This region serves the inquiry eminently because of the richness of its materials on that period of art. Medieval art has much to offer in the context of Orissa as well as of other regions in the Indian sub-continent. As for Orissa, its context is particularly relevant as it is generally held that temple architecture, along with its figural embellishment, arrived here in full maturity with its genesis or antecedents not convincingly identified or demarcated. But the chronological proximity of Orissan art with the post-Gupta phase in the neighbouring regions need not be in doubt. These factors as well as the compactness of Orissan monuments as a group substantially facilitate addressing issues regarding the post-Gupta Orissan art, and this has been comprehensively attempted in this book. The authors of the book are fairly conversant with the history of Orissa and its art tradition. In fact,

Behera's two volume study on Konark (1993) is amongst the most recent works on the subject and substantial in content. Similarly, Donaldson's *Hindu Temple Art of Orissa* (1985-87; in three volumes) remains the most comprehensive narrative on the subject till date. It is, therefore, fitting that these two scholars should be collaborating to produce a work which offers an authentic record of major themes and styles of the post-Gupta sculptures of Orissa.

## Temple Sculpture

The narrative inherits substantially from the scholars' previous writings and covers temple sculptures from around the seventh to the thirteenth centuries, although developments till the fifteenth century occur sporadically in the text. The themes largely represent religious art, and the images of deities of Jain, Buddhist and Hindu pantheons have been discussed, both in respect of iconography and elements of style. The division of sculptures according to the major sectarian groups and their sub-sects allows an analytical survey of these figures, even as it accommodates variations and incongruities in stylistic progression across the wider expanse of the region and within the given chronology. The two chapters on 'History' and 'Religion' at the beginning are useful in foregrounding art activity against these essential backdrops. Historical episodes and their religious underpinnings have on occasion been specifically contextualised, even outside these two chapters, in particular depictions. For instance, in the case of a relief at Konark (p. 86) depicting a marriage celebration, with the ruling chief disguised as a divinity. The punning on words intended here synchronizes the divine with the regal, and suggests a sanctified temporality where kingship assumes a divine legitimacy.

The work under review is fundamentally different from canon-based studies on Orissan art of which there is no dearth. Many canonical texts have been brought to light in Orissa and their relevance in interpreting

art, iconography and architecture of the region is not in doubt. These texts, discovered and edited by N. K. Bose (1932), Alice Boner and her associates (1966-1982), and Bettina Baumar and Rajendra Prasad Das (1994), represent a separate genre of study, having much to offer in terms of matching particular monuments and their statuary both at the conceptual and technical levels. They also offer a significant account of varying forms and types of sculpture and the artisan's visions of creativity. In some cases, such as that of the *Vastusutra Upanishad* (ed. Alice Boner, rep. 1994), the canonical text works out figural compositions in alliance with their aesthetic imagery through a series of prescribed artisanal modes and devices which produced images out of their compositional diagrams. This and other such texts have added a new dimension to the theoretical content and historiography of Orissan art. These have also facilitated the firm identification of particular temple types and their basic compositional character. Such a correspondence between conceptual form and its material counterpart has been appropriately explained in the cases of the Varahi temple at Chaurasi and the Rajarani-Rajeshwari temple of Bhubaneswar, thanks to the identification based on particular Shilpa texts.

The book under review bears no resemblance with such concerns and is quite different in its genre and design. It formulates typological sets of figural compositions to trace their stylistic development through their chronological stages in succession. In the process, particular images, with or without a sectarian affiliation, come into discussion. The discussion covers their iconographic peculiarities, nomenclature and stylistic features as they matured from time to time and place to place. Particular themes are consolidated along with relevant commentary on their stylistic evolution. The selection of figures as 'masterpieces' is incidental and meant largely to illustrate the general narrative. The details often indicate that the salience of images on a monument depended on their occurrence according to a consciously articulated programme, in which placements often invested on particular figures the value of location. This helped in validating the distribution pattern or a programme of figure work over the body of a temple. As the monuments developed and expanded morphologically, sideways or vertically, new

iconographic types were accommodated, especially in the positions of the figure work, and this rendered the programme of figural distribution more detailed and complex.

The narrative also takes care of sculptures in terms of their evolution, style and iconography. Some 208 figures have been illustrated of which three are in polychrome. Explanatory notes (pp.105-140) describe them with further details. Brahmanical iconography encompasses a fairly pervasive pantheon consisting of cult deities, secondary deities and their primary as well as emanatory forms. These different forms have been typologically listed and discussed according to the varieties encountered in them. Iconographic descriptions cover a wide spectrum, dealing with what is called the *pancha-devata*, e.g., Shiva, Vishnu, Surya, Devi and Ganesh, and many more types within the first four of these categories. Related descriptions form the bulk of the book (pp. 65-98), but Jain and Buddhist images have also been independently covered in two different sections (pp. 43-52). The material on Buddhist images is particularly informative and significant in its coverage of both major and secondary deities. Lalitgiri and Ratnagiri have long been known as centres of Tantric Buddhism in Orissa and the sculptures discussed or illustrated in the book indicate the impact of Buddhism on the region, including Tantric Buddhism which appears to be more widespread than has been made out so far. The Buddhist statuary reproduced in the work is fairly representative and remarkable. This is especially true of the images of the Bodhisattvas Maitreya, Rakta Lokeshvara, Manjushri, and Manjuvara (Plates 29-32).

## Secular Motifs

The book has a short chapter on secular motifs in Orissan art. It includes erotic images besides those of royal personages, warriors, and panels depicting groups of disciples with their teachers. These depictions present an interesting variety and offer glimpses of the mundane affairs of a cross-section of the contemporary society. They also reflect the efforts of the artist to selectively juxtapose the divine with the mundane. 'Secularised Imagery' is interpreted by the authors with reference to depictions representing the 'replacement of Brahmanical divinities by secular motifs' or in terms of the 'sanctification of secular motifs in the iconographic programme'

(p. 99). This interpretation retains an exclusive secular space for non-religious art in the Orissan temple art, and asserts its flow from the manner in which such scenes are placed in the decorative programme of statuary. Independent evidence from Orissan texts as well as from the widely distributed reliefs offers some ground to identify motifs which may be purely non-religious in character. We may randomly refer to two such depictions. Of these, one is from Konark and it portrays the catching of a wild elephant and also quartering the tame ones within a temporary enclosure. Similarly, a (wooden) ramp for moving construction materials from ground level to the upper levels of a structure is depicted on a slab reused in a recently constructed temple near Puri. These scenes represent purely secular motifs with little suggestion of any ritualistic or religious context. In addition, there are grounds to believe that the craft tradition in India was quite independent of religious control. The Shilpa texts from Orissa have sometimes forcefully asserted their freedom from orthodox systems and advocated an alternative spiritual domain in their craft. Such assertions, along with the depictions mentioned above, give reason to underscore the validity of a secular space in the art traditions in Orissa and elsewhere. The sources from Orissa, especially texts like Baya Chakada, contain significant information on that count.

There is a chapter on the stylistic development of Orissan sculpture (pp. 34-42), where style is interpreted in terms of formats comprehended in the general layout of figures on a stele, or in the accessory details, or even in the manner in which the images were placed on the niches provided on different parts of a temple. The consistency with regard to variance in the patterns of carvings has been used to trace the evolution of style. The discussion tends to show a very rudimentary conceptualization of style. Interestingly, the decorative devices do indicate continuities of the same patterns on several images, regardless of their sectarian affiliations. There are hints in these modes of the same artist or the same workshop producing works according to the same layout and design but varying their sectarian affiliations mainly by sewing the required iconographic details, obviously to meet the demands of the patron.

R. N. Misra teaches at the Department of Ancient History and Culture, Jiwaji University, Gwalior.

## A journalistic possibility

Tridip Suhrud

**A Possible India: Essays in Political Criticism**  
by Partha Chatterjee

Oxford University Press, Delhi, 1997; xii+301 pp; Rs. 495

Partha Chatterjee begins this collection of essays with an explanation. An explanation about so far not having written 'a single volume study of Indian politics, despite the fact that, over the years, many people have reminded me that this was entirely expected of me as an Indian political scientist.' He provides an answer to why he has not undertaken such a study: 'to put it plainly, the reason was that I did not know how to write such a book.' This inability arose out of the difficulty of defining his own location in relation to the institutions and processes of Indian polity. Having obtained the 'analytical language that was derived — unabashedly — from Marx, Lenin and Mao Zedong,' Chatterjee has, in this book, attempted to speak on behalf of the ruled. He is uncertain about the authenticity of that voice, but is glad about the freedom from any party line that was available to him. If the imposition of Emergency in June 1975 raised serious doubts about doctrinal understanding, it also confirmed beliefs about the nature of the ruling coalition, and the necessity of electoral democracy for maintaining that balance.

### The Missing Book

In this ideological terrain, there was no framework which could provide a ground from which to view the Indian polity. 'There was no position I could truthfully occupy from which I might claim to provide a panoptic view of Indian politics.' But he continued to write a weekly column for *Frontier*, 'not as a journalist would...but as a critic trying to match structure to event, institution to process, claim to fact.' It is these essays which form the core of the present collection. Apart from them, it contains book reviews, editorial comments, journal entries and polemical writings. 'I offer this volume in place of the book on Indian politics that I will never write.' According to Chatterjee, these essays, written over more than twenty years, are governed by a theoretical concern. Concern about the 'politics of the governed'.

The two substantial essays which form a part of this collection are 'Secularism and Toleration' and 'Talking of Modernity in Two Languages,' both of which have been commented upon and discussed for many years now. The rest of the essays comment on the drama of Indian politics as it unfolds. Despite their topicality and journalistic tenor, the concerns of a very thoughtful intellectual are evident. The short lived Janata experiment, the drama of the curious government of Charan Singh, the final years of Indira Gandhi, the rise and fall of Rajiv Gandhi, and the NF/UF experiments are all commented upon. Many a time, his analysis has the capacity to see the form of things to come.

*Despite his great analytical sensitivity, and the ability to see the present and in some cases the future clearly, the collection remains anchored in contemporary political events. The critic responds to these events as they happen. The journalistic mode looms large. These do not allow for a theory of Indian society, polity or governance to emerge*

Commenting on the possible election strategy of the Congress in the November 1989 elections, he says that the campaign would include a 'saturation campaign of glorification of the assassinated leader, coupled with patriotic fervour and a subtle undertone of Hindu chauvinism.' And predicts the long term fall out of the strategy conceived by the 'computer boys of 1, Akbar Road.' If they are proved right, warns Chatterjee, 'they will then embark on their cherished project of giving a new look to India's economy and polity. For a vast majority of the people of this country, that can only be a change for the worse.' When the nation was celebrating the emergence of a new, dynamic, clean and efficient leadership, Chatterjee

was able to perceive, as early as February 1985, the hollowness of the claims and the lack of any long term vision. 'The new government has done remarkably well in its first two months in giving the impression of undertaking wholesale changes in policy without actually doing any thing...except for a vague profession of intent nothing concrete has emerged.'

Even while being polemical, Chatterjee has the remarkable ability to capture the inherent logic of structures and processes. This allows him to look into the future. Discussing the intra-party democracy in the Congress, he says, '...we will have sufficient number of PCC resolutions urging Mrs. Sonia Gandhi to become Congress president!'

### In Lieu of Theory

Despite his great analytical sensitivity, and the ability to see the present and in some cases the future clearly, the collection remains anchored in contemporary political events. The critic responds to these events as they happen. The journalistic mode looms large. These do not allow for a theory of Indian society, polity or governance to emerge. What emerges is a sharp, incisive critique, an untiring spirit of inquiry in the tradition of Nikhil Chakravarty and Romesh Thapar. This undoubtedly has a place in our intellectual life, in our endeavours to study and understand the institutions, the processes, and the structures of the Indian state.

What we also require is a theory (theories?) of Indian polity. Partha Chatterjee's collection does not fill that lack. We have a right to expect a much more cohesive study from one of our most perceptive intellectuals. We cannot, however, accept this collection in lieu of a larger study that he 'does not know how to write.'

Tridip Suhrud is on the faculty of the National Institute of Design, Ahmedabad.

The hottest  
new  
trend  
in academic  
journalism!  
Summerhill  
IIAS Review  
Subscribe now!